



Week 1, Video 5

Case Study – San Pedro

Case Study of Classification

- With educational data
- Thousands of examples to choose from
- This example is one I know particularly well

Case Study of Classification

- San Pedro, M.O.Z., Baker, R.S.J.d., Bowers, A.J., Heffernan, N.T. (2013) Predicting College Enrollment from Student Interaction with an Intelligent Tutoring System in Middle School. *Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Educational Data Mining*, 177-184.



Research Goal

- Can we predict student college attendance
- Based on student engagement and learning in middle school mathematics
- Using fine-grained indicators distilled from interactions with educational software in middle school (~5 years earlier)

Why?

- We can infer engagement and learning in middle school, which supports
 - Automated intervention
 - Providing actionable info to teachers and school leaders
- But which indicators of engagement and learning really matter?
 - Can we find indicators that a student is at-risk, that we can act on, before problem becomes critical?

ASSISTments



Assessment - Practicing Content - Windows Internet Explorer

ASSISTment

The diagram below shows a statistical analysis among the percentages of students who chose to take Biology, Algebra or Band. If 900 students signed up to take courses, how many will not be taking Biology, Algebra or Band?

Student Registration

The Main Question
Skills: *Area, Algebra, Probability*

Sorry, that is incorrect. Lets move on and figure out why!

In order to find out how many students will **not** be taking Biology, Algebra or Band that figure out how many will be. What is it?

The 1st Scaffolding Question
Skill: *Basic Probability*

Sum up all of the percentages shown in the diagram above.

Student Registration

The Message

75% Correct

Correct, how you need to find out the percentage of students who did NOT sign up for Biology, Algebra or Band.

The 2nd Scaffolding Question
Skill: *Basic Probability*

225 Correct

How you are ready to try the original problem again. If 900 students signed up to take courses, how many will not be taking Biology, Algebra or Band?

The 3rd Scaffolding Question
Skill: *Area, Algebra*

2430

You did not check if your answer was reasonable (it must be less than 900). It looks like you forgot to move the decimal after you multiplied.

Engage Message



Log Data

- 3,747 students
 - In 3 school districts in Massachusetts
 - 1 urban
 - 2 suburban
- Completed 494,150 math problems
 - Working approximately 1 class period a week for the entire year
- Making 2,107,108 problem-solving attempts or hint requests in ASSISTments
- Between 2004-2007

Data set

- Records about whether student eventually attended college
- 58% of students in sample attended college



Automated Detectors

- A number of automated detectors were applied to the data from ASSISTments
- These detectors had themselves been previously developed using prediction modeling and were published in previous papers, including (Pardos et al., 2013)
- Building a detector and then using it in another analysis is called *discovery with models*

Automated Detectors

- Learning
 - Bayesian Knowledge Tracing; we'll discuss this later in the course

Disengagement Detectors (No sensors! Just log files!)

- Gaming the System
 - Intentional misuse of educational software
 - Systematic Guessing or Rapid Hint Requests
- Off-Task Behavior
 - Stopping work in educational software to do unrelated task
 - Does **not** include talking to the teacher or another student about math; these can be distinguished by behavior before and after a pause
- Carelessness
 - Making errors despite knowing skill

Affect Detectors (No sensors! Just log files!)



- Boredom
- Frustration
- Confusion
- Engaged Concentration

College Attendance Model

- Predict whether a student attended college from a student's year-long average according to the detectors
- **Logistic Regression** Classifier (binary data)
- Cross-validated at the student-level
 - We'll discuss this next week

Individual Feature Predictiveness

	College	Mean	Std. Dev.	t-value
Student Knowledge	NO	0.292	0.151	-15.481
	YES	0.378	0.180	(p<0.01)
Correctness	NO	0.382	0.161	-17.793
	YES	0.483	0.182	(p<0.01)
Boredom	NO	0.287	0.045	5.974
	YES	0.278	0.047	(p<0.01)
Engaged Concentration	NO	0.483	0.041	-11.979
	YES	0.500	0.044	(p<0.01)
Confusion	NO	0.130	0.054	5.686
	YES	0.120	0.052	(p<0.01)

Individual Feature Predictiveness

	College	Mean	Std. Dev.	t-value
Off-Task	NO	0.304	0.119	1.184 p=0.237
	YES	0.300	0.116	
Gaming	NO	0.041	0.062	8.862 (p<0.01)
	YES	0.026	0.044	
Carelessness	NO	0.132	0.066	-13.361 (p<0.01)
	YES	0.165	0.077	
Number of First Actions (Proxy for Attendance)	NO	114.50 0	91.771	-8.673 (p<0.01)
	YES	144.56 0	113.35 7	

Full Model

- $A' = 0.686$, Kappa = 0.247
- χ^2 (df = 6, N = 3747) = 386.502, $p < 0.001$
(computed for a non-cross-validated model)
- R^2 (Cox & Snell) = 0.098, R^2 (Nagelkerke) = 0.132
- Overall accuracy = 64.6%; Precision = 66.4%;
Recall rate = 78.3%

Final Model (Logistic Regression)

CollegeEnrollment =
+ 1.119 StudentKnowledge
+ 0.698 Correctness
+ 0.261 NumFirstActions
– 1.145 Carelessness
+ 0.217 Confusion
+ 0.169 Boredom
+ 0.351

Flipped Signs

CollegeEnrollment =
+ 1.119 StudentKnowledge
+ 0.698 Correctness
+ 0.261 NumFirstActions
- 1.145 Carelessness
+ 0.217 Confusion
+ 0.169 Boredom
+ 0.351

Implications

- Carelessness is bad... once we take knowledge into account
- Boredom is not a major problem... among knowledgeable students
 - When unsuccessful bored students are removed, all that may remain are those who become bored because material may be too easy
 - Does not mean boredom is a good thing!

Implications

- Gaming the System drops out of model
 - Probably because gaming substantially hurts learning
 - But just because Gaming->Dropout is likely mediated by learning, doesn't mean gaming doesn't matter!
 - 0.34 σ effect

Implications

- Off-Task Behavior is not such a big deal
 - How much effort goes into stopping it?
 - Past meta-analyses find small significant effect on short-term measures of learning
 - But not when collaborative learning is occurring?

Implications

- In-the-moment interventions provided by software (or suggested by software to teachers) may have unexpectedly large effects, if they address boredom, confusion, carelessness, gaming the system

Next Lecture



- Less conservative classification algorithms